A POLYMATH ANTHROPOLOGIST:  
ESSAYS IN HONOUR OF ANN CHOWNING. 

Edited by Claudia Gross, Harriet D. Lyons and Dorothy A. Counts.  
Department of Anthropology. The University of Auckland. 259pp.  

Reviewed by 
Eleanor Rimoldi, Massey University.

This collection of essays in honour of Ann Chowning is of interest not only for their celebration of her own career, but for the way in which she has influenced many others through her research and her teaching. Ann’s early training and subsequent research reflects the emphasis in American anthropology on all the sub-disciplines of anthropology represented in this volume with sections on archaeology/physical anthropology, social/cultural anthropology, and linguistics. She has maintained all these interests – a committed generalist albeit with a strong emphasis on Melanesia. There are moments in this book when Ann seems to take on the character of an indomitable lady traveler in exotic locations – to be found on archaeological digs in the Yucatan or Guatemala, or struggling in West New Britain ‘with a recently dislocated knee, traveling over the arduous trails with slippery slopes, potholes, and a variety of primitive log bridges over gushing rivers’ in Jane Goodale’s account of their shared journey in 1963 (p. 242). But overwhelmingly these essays reveal a dedicated scholar whose life as an anthropologist is rich and varied both as an ethnographer and a teacher.

A festschrift is read in many different ways, but apart from the specialist interest of individual essays, there is the insight they provide into the life of an academic – their particular personal and intellectual milieu. The comprehensive, survey approach reflected in Ann Chowning’s work in Melanesia tells of a time when anthropologists saw themselves as ‘mapping’ the Pacific – its history, its physical environment, and its people. Ann’s career spanned the years of Australian administration of Papua and New Guinea as well as the early years of the newly independent nation of Papua New Guinea when anthropologists were ‘consulted and listened to’ (xiii). At that time anthropologists were the
authority on everything from stamp design to health issues. Many of the early graduates of the University of Papua New Guinea who went on to be leaders in government, business, and education were students of anthropologists like Chowning, Ralph Bulmer, and Andrew Strathern. The ANU Research School of Pacific and Asian Studies, and the New Guinea Research Unit provided an almost open access to research with financial backing, field support, and a network of colleagues. These were heady days when anthropologists had the rare opportunity to feel they were part of ‘nation building,’ when they were needed and listened to.

The four essays in Part 1 by Swadling, Specht, Bulmer and Swindler focus on archaeology or physical anthropology in Melanesia, or wider Oceania. There are fifteen essays in the section on Social and Cultural Anthropology (Harriet D. Lyons and Andrew P. Lyons, Mark Mosko, Penelope Schoeffel, Phyllis S. Herda, Mark Busse, Judith Huntsman, Julie Park, Maev O’Collins, Marilyn Strathern, Michael Monsell-Davis, John Barker, Christine Dureau, Dorothy Ayers Counts and David Counts, Joan Metge, Claudia Gross). Most of these focus on ethnographic themes in Oceania – sex, gender, kinship, development and change, symbols, and, as an insight into the light reading so enjoyed by Ann Chowning, the essay by Claudia Gross on detective fiction. Some of the authors in this section are, like Ann, ‘b4s’ (‘before’ PNG independence) whose time in New Guinea began during the colonial period (and many remain involved to the present day). Contributions here from anthropologists, whose field studies focus on Polynesia or New Zealand, also represent a long term commitment. This collection overall is indicative of the contribution that anthropology makes to history – not just in the archaeological essays, but also the long term ethnographic studies and the six linguistic essays (Laurie Bauer, Robin Hooper, John Lynch, Malcolm Ross, Ward H. Goodenough, Andrew Pawley).

My own fieldwork began the very year of Papua New Guinea independence and traveling back and forth through Port Moresby to and from Bougainville I experienced glimpses of the ‘b4s’ and watched the gradual dismantling of the systems that smoothed the path for anthropologists and other researchers in Papua New Guinea. As described by Ann in the Judith Huntsman interview, ‘[b]efore PNG gained Independence and in the years immediately thereafter, government officials had made the arrangements or been willing to help. Later, officials at local Government stations often just did not care…’ (xiv). Interestingly, one thing missing in this otherwise excellent collection is a sense of the rough politics, contemporary or historical, in the period stretching from the 1950s to the present within the discipline itself, or the Pacific region (with the
possible exception of Maev O’Collins’ essay on the many faces of development). Instead the overall impression is of a dignified, classical anthropology diligent in its attention to detail, observing, recording, advising when asked, comparative in the sense that there is always an exception that moderates the headlong rush into rash declarations. But this is a festschrift after all, and in honour of a very specific anthropologist who represents those very values, and presents us with an occasion to be reminded of their virtue.
OCEANIC MUSIC ENCOUNTERS: 
ESSAYS IN HONOUR OF MERVYN MCLEAN
Edited by Richard Moyle
Department of Anthropology, The University of Auckland.

Reviewed by
Allan Thomas,
New Zealand School of Music of Massey and Victoria Universities.

Essays in Honour of Mervyn McLean brings together an interesting variety of papers from colleagues working in different areas of Oceania – Micronesia, Polynesia, Melanesia, and Australia and the Torres Strait Islands – though none from McLean’s own field of study: the music of Maori. An introduction and biography of McLean contributed by editor Richard Moyle, together with a list of publications, completes the monograph in a publication which is a fitting tribute to McLean as a major contributor to the understanding of music in Oceania and leading ethnomusicologist in this country.

Since his retirement, Mervyn McLean has had an astoundingly productive decade with five major books, as well as articles and reviews and catalogues from the Archive of Maori and Pacific Music which he established at the University of Auckland. His book publications of this period begin with the long awaited monograph Maori Music (Auckland University Press, 1996), which is based on the author’s field work recordings and his discoveries of all the printed references to the music from the origins of European settlement, and contributions from two noted Maori experts. As if to frame and extend this book, McLean has written on the context of Maori music in the music of Polynesia (Weavers of Song, Auckland 1999), and on one of the Maori kaumatua who assisted him (Songs of a Kaumatua Sung by Kino Hughes, Auckland 2002), and a fieldwork memorandum of his own (To Tatau Waka. In Search of Maori Music 1958–1979, Auckland 2004). In all of this McLean has pursued a particular style of ethnomusicology which he reinforces with a final book on the researchers who have been, in his view, the greats of the discipline though little represented in contemporary thought.
McLean’s ethnomusicology was formed in the 1960s in studies with Alan Merriam at Indiana University and in fieldwork in Maori traditional waiata. If we view ethnomusicology at that early stage as a largely analytical exercise of Comparative Musicology which gave way to an ‘Anthropology of Music’, we can see what an exciting arena the discipline has been. The challenges of the psychological, social and cultural understandings of musical activity, the description of the performance event (including dance, ritual or festive elements), the demands of a proper investigator-informant relationship, the understanding of intellectual property… all these have impinged on the researcher of McLean’s generation. The papers chart some of the changes that have occurred in the move from a rudimentary form of the discipline to acknowledge the many aspects now accepted. An unusual feature of the festschrift is the fact that it comes in the midst of a flurry of work from McLean, rather than as a reflective ending to his career, and it also testifies to the ongoing collegiality of a group of scholars most of whom are brought together as members of the Study Group on the Musics of Oceania of the International Council for Traditional Music.

In one of the papers, which especially caught my attention and seems to have provided, along with others, the theme of ‘encounters’ in the title of the collection, Brian Diettrich writes of the moment of recording as a heightened interaction between ethnomusicologist and subject, an ‘encounter’, and compares a number of historic examples from recordings in Chuuk state, Micronesia. This way of looking at recording brings into play a number of neglected factors: who selects the music, how the acoustic of the recording is managed, how close to a normal performance the recording approximates, what effect ‘being recorded’ has on the performer’s self image and subsequent musical life. Scope is given in this interaction for the ethnomusicologist or the subject to be the principal manager, and for the two sides to see the event differently. While ethnomusicologists have always wanted to know about the context of a musical recording, including any payments made for it and the extent to which it approximates a real performance situation, it has rarely been shown as in this paper that the performers and ethnomusicologists have a live encounter which has far-reaching effects.

Dan Bendrups continues the recording-encounter theme in a consideration of Rapanui, Easter Island music, and Helen Black extends it to the encounter between Fijians and the Methodist church in the fascinating tale of hymn development in Fiji, in which hymns incorporate or utilise indigenous forms of music. Another kind of encounter is shown in the paper by Barbara Smith, herself the subject of a recent festschrift, which brings together two versions
of a traditional Hawaiian chant. The paper is sourced to ‘the repertoire of the highly respected culture bearer and authority on Hawaiian culture, the late Mary Kawena Pukui (1895–1986)’ (p. 25). Here Smith closely examines the chants and the information that Mary Pukui gave. It is an inspiration to see the care and attention focused on the testimony of this great traditional scholar, and a reminder of the source of most ethnomusicological work in the ideas and musical activities of traditional practitioners. In one section of the essay the instrumental music accompaniment is described: Mrs Pukui named the instrument and the rhythm that it played, but the sound of the instrument is said not to be named (even though there is a huge lexicon of the sounds of the voice in Hawai’ian chant). Is it significant that the instrument (giving its name to the type of hula) and the rhythmic pattern (important in the dance presentation) are both named while the sound is left unnamed?

Another substantial paper comes from a multidisciplinary group of scholars in Australia working with a song from the tradition of the Wadeye Aboriginal community on the northern coast, south of Darwin. Linda Barwick, Allan Marett, Joe Blythe and Michael Walsh are able to compare 99 versions of a song held in the indigenous archive. The paper comes to the conclusion that the seemingly random and disorientating structure and music/text relationships in this song are an intentional strategy in this mortuary song, a level of sophistication in the text/music/context relationships which is seldom encountered. The essay gives especial pleasure because it is a reminder of the work of the late Catherine Ellis (for whom Linda Barwick was a research assistant) who at conferences that I attended through the 1980s would reveal the results of her studies of Aboriginal music, a passionate, secretive, complex music. This echo of Catherine Ellis’s work brings together three great pioneers in the region’s ethnomusicology: Mervyn McLean, Barbara Smith and Catherine Ellis.

Don Niles writes persuasively of the songs of the Dunas people of Papua New Guinea who creatively mix the mission and colonial songs of their recent history into a unique and powerful comment on political or social affairs. Along with other papers in the collection, the translation of songs is a major responsibility of the ethnomusicologist who seeks to assign a meaning to the musical activity. There are many resonances in the collection of the progress of work in the Pacific region during the watch of Mervyn McLean: Richard Moyle’s fine paper has its origin in fieldwork for the Territorial Survey of Pacific Music, a project initiated by McLean to document little known musics in the region; Raymond Amman provides a paper on the ‘Nose Flute in Melanesia,’ concluding as did Mervyn McLean for Aotearoa/New Zealand that some at least of the references to the instrument may be ‘fairytale’; Jane Moulin enters the newer
world of the stage show in Tahitian performance with a careful and measured tread; the Hawai’ian hula in the Torres Strait Islands is nicely caught in the testimony of the islanders who performed it in a paper by Lyn Costigan and Karl Neuenfeldt. Each of the separate articles repays attention to its content and to the paradigm under which it is working. Richard Moyle is to be congratulated in assembling such a rich cross section of current work in the Pacific to honour Mervyn McLean.
NORMAL HUMANNESS, CHANGE AND POWER IN HUMAN ASSISTED REPRODUCTIVE TECHNOLOGY:
AN ANALYSIS OF THE WRITTEN PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS TO THE NEW ZEALAND PARLIAMENTARY HEALTH COMMITTEE IN 2003.
By Julie Park, Laura McLauchlan and Elizabeth Frengley.

THE SOCIAL ECOLOGY OF NEW TECHNOLOGIES AND HAEMOPHILIA IN NEW ZEALAND:
A BLEEDING NUISANCE REVISITED.
By Julie Park and Deon York.

Reviewed by
Chrystal Jaye
Department of General Practice, Dunedin School of Medicine

Normal Humanness, Change and Power in Human Assisted Reproductive Technology reports a discourse analysis of public submissions made to the Parliamentary Health committee on the Human Assisted Reproductive Technologies (HART) Bill and Supplementary Order Paper 80 in 2003. The authors identified three dominant discourses within submissions: a dominant 'medical-scientific' discourse, and a 'Christian-identified', and 'social model of disability’ counter discourses. These discourses underlay the primary issues of concern within submissions which were categorised into five themes: normality; natural vs social constructs; humanness; moral decline; and rights and power. This analysis offers a fascinating examination of the ways in which categories of humanness, normality, and natural are socially constructed within, and contested between various social institutions and interest groups.

Submissions across all discourse categories made strong links between normality and naturalness, and similarly, abnormality and unnaturalness – par-
particularly with reference to the possibility of ‘designer babies’. As the authors note, developments in assisted human reproduction push at the boundaries of kinship and normative procreative behaviours. Similarly, submissions tended to oppose categories of ‘natural’ (often conflated with ‘normal’ in submissions), against the agendas of social institutions (in the Foucauldian sense) such as science and commerce, and also around the changing composition and meanings of ‘family’ and ‘kin’.

The issue of when human life begins was a key problematic for submissions – illustrating the social construction of biology and personhood, and contested discourses around the relationship of these categories. Some submissions used the example of gamete donation to trouble what they viewed as the increasing commodification of humanity. It was interesting that submissions generally assumed that the desire to have children (particularly for women) was natural and self-evident although as the authors note, the desire to bear children is historically and culturally variable.

The beginnings and endings of life provoke intense moral debate. The authors identified a theme of moral (and social) decline resulting from technological advances and their application, noting that such concerns were voiced by groups neither directly or personally affected by AHR technologies. Similarly, the ethics of individuals’ rights and decision making power around conception and gestation were troubled in submissions. In fact, it seemed to me that all the identified themes were strongly undergirded by both covert and overt moral discourses. For example, there was obviously a fascinating set of contested discourses around individual agency and societal regulation hidden in these submissions. Decisions about choices available to individuals and the ways in which the rights of particular groups are given precedence over the rights of other groups are moral at their very core because they concern questions about what is the ‘right’ thing to do, the ‘good’ thing to do. In fact, questions (and assertions) about what is ‘right’ and ‘good’ clearly lie at the heart of all the major themes discussed in this manuscript.


This fascinating monograph updates previous work by these authors. It reports on ethnographic research into the embodied experiences of living with haemophilia. The stated aims of this study were to provide information that will assist the haemophilia community, clinicians and health planners in dealing with the treatment and management of haemophilia, including the potentials
of new diagnostic and treatment technologies. Specifically, they focus on the domains of new reproductive technologies, carrier issues, gene therapy and hepatitis C. They also report on key relationships in the haemophilia social and medical landscape; these include haemophilia affected individuals and families, the Haemophilia Foundation of New Zealand (HFNZ), the health sector, and pharmaceutical companies.

I learned a great deal about the condition of haemophilia and the significant morbidity and quality of life issues associated with it such as the serious consequences of brain bleeds, and bleeding into joints. Just being born can be life threatening for an infant with haemophilia. I also gained a very sympathetic impression of the daily struggle to manage health and safety. Of particular interest was the way that parents managed their children’s conditions. Particularly poignant was the example of what appeared to be racist stereotyping and a subsequent police investigation into a Maori child’s bruising prior to a diagnosis of haemophilia being made.

One major theme concerned resource issues around haemophilia as the cost of treatment is very high and, in the absence of a national health service for haemophilia, is unevenly distributed among DHBS because of the pragmatic choices that families with haemophilia members make about where to live. The prevalent discourse around cost management within health services means that people with haemophilia are constantly reminded that they are an enormous financial burden on the health sector and, by implication, the nation.

Hepatitis C is widely prevalent within the haemophilia community as a result of unsafe blood products used until 1993. Living with the dual burden of morbidity of haemophilia and hepatitis C imposed greater limitations and levels of treatment on participants. Fully funded dual treatment for both hepatitis C and haemophilia has only been available from 2004. Since the research was conducted, the HFNZ lobby for a treatment and welfare package has been successful.

Haemophilia is a genetic condition that is expressed in males although females may be carriers and experience bleeding problems. The new reproductive technologies available increase the options for members of the haemophilia community to manage their own reproduction and the hereditary transmission of the condition in their families. The authors report a wide range of strategies for managing reproduction – ranging from prophylactic sterilisation, to using prenatal genetic testing to determine the status of foetuses, and pre-implantation selection of embryos. Advancements in treatment and management
have improved the quality of life for people with haemophilia, but there were varying interpretations around the meaning of reproductive choices which, the authors note, all have to be accommodated by the haemophilia community and the HFNZ. The excerpts from interviews offer fascinating and moving reflections of the ways in which participants negotiate the complicated territories of reproductive technologies in considering practicalities, rights and ethics in their own lives and those of their existing and future children.

The authors conclude by commenting that in the period of time since their most recent update on *A Bleeding Nuisance*, advances in treatment for haemophilia have reduced the levels of stress for parents and also reduced perceptions of the seriousness of the condition among participants although they were also more aware of the costs of treatment.

Although these manuscripts deal with quite different issues, they both offer fascinating examples of contested and competing discourses around human assisted reproductive technologies. While the submissions analysed in *Normal Humanness, Change and Power in Human Assisted Reproductive Technology* appeared to represent ethical and moral interest group standpoints, participants in *The Social Ecology of New Technologies and Haemophilia in New Zealand* represent embodied and lived perspectives of those directly affected by these technologies. Both publications make a significant contribution to the field of medical anthropology and the anthropology of health in New Zealand.
This richly illustrated book is a welcome addition to the literature on New Zealand’s Asian communities. As a volume entirely dedicated to the Indian community in this country, this must rank as a pioneering work. Although the community has a long history dating back to the early decades after the Treaty of Waitangi, there has not been a comprehensive book chronicling the history of Indians in this country.

The strength of this volume lies in the richness of the families’ stories, the tales of remarkable resilience and resourcefulness of the pioneer men and women, the human drama and the saga of how generations of Indians succeeded in maintaining their dignity as individuals while also keeping their community cohesion in the face of exclusion and discrimination. The involvement of Indian New Zealanders in the patriotic movements when India struggled for independence is a comparatively under-researched subject which warrants closer study.

The text runs in a largely chronological flow and the style is narrative rather than discursive or analytical. It seems the author wants the stories of the families and individuals to bear witness to the changing times, and does not wish to interrupt the flow with overt theorisation and academic analysis which might be too dry. The book is therefore very readable: with one story following on from another. The photographs of the early men as itinerant labourers are interspersed with images of couples and families, school groups, sports clubs and community associations. Each vividly illustrates a particular aspect of the development of the Indian community and is closely related to the text it seeks to illustrate.
The writer and the editor are to be commended on the clever use of ‘boxes’ in the text. Each is introduced as a ‘side remark’, ‘interesting anecdote’, or piece of ‘supplementary information’ related to the chapter. Because anecdotes and short biographies cannot be easily incorporated into the main text without interrupting the narrative flow, the information is put into one of these boxes. For example, the first box is devoted to ‘J.K. Natali’ who was a successful pioneer entrepreneur, and the ‘Natal’ connection came from the family’s link to South Africa. Then a large box is allocated to the description of ‘Cram schools in Fiji’, special schools where some prospective Indian migrants studied English before coming to New Zealand. More boxes are devoted to colourful personalities active in a particular era. Indar Singh, the Sikh hawker who sold silks and fineries, Bhimabhai Hari Desai, the owner of Turkish baths, and Ravji Hari, the market gardener, each have a box highlighting the remarkable events of their lives. The idea, of course, is that all these life stories weave together a rich mosaic of the Indian community at the time. Leckie has succeeded in conveying the heterogeneity and vibrancy of the community in a coherent historical narrative without sacrificing the details of each individual family story.

Some readers might like to have issues like the caste system, the changing social climate of New Zealand, the geo-political reality of British India (how it changed from being the jewel of the Crown into a hotbed of militant nationalism), and how all these impacted on the development of the Indian community in New Zealand, discussed in a more analytical manner. But this does not seem to be the author’s intention. These issues, each a serious topic of in-depth study and investigation by other historians and social scientists, remain part of the backdrop to the human drama in this book.

In this reviewer’s view, the rather light narrative style of the book is quite deliberate, probably adopted because the intention of the writer and editor is to make the work as widely appealing and accessible to general readers as possible. This is clear in Chapter 3, ‘Exclusion and Discrimination’. Leckie has written on this topic before in two journal articles published in the 1980s, analysing the events in Pukekohe which triggered the anti-Indian feelings, the wider climate of social-Darwinism of the Franklin District, and how a localised movement in one small rural area spread to become a nationwide campaign against ‘Asiatics’. The style of the earlier articles was incisive and critical and the tone much more indicting and fiery. I do not think that Leckie found the anti-Asian stance of the White New Zealand League any more forgivable when she wrote this present volume; rather, the ‘toning down’ seems to be part of a deliberate attempt to not make any reader uncomfortable. The chapter has included the efforts of the Indian community to counter blatant racism:
the petition by New Zealand Indians against the White New Zealand League is presented in a box in this chapter on anti-Asian discrimination. It also includes three casual snapshots (as opposed to formal, ‘staged’ photographs) showing everyday scenes in Pukekohe with the subjects looking relaxed and totally at ease: Indian families enjoying a hangi, several Indian growers drinking beer happily after work, and an Indian man standing by his tractor. Since images speak a thousand words, the clever inclusion of these photographs in the long text describing the activities of the White New Zealand League must be considered as effective contrast and unstated refutation of the racial slurs and the League’s efforts to depict Indians as the inassimilable alien.

Chapter 4, ‘Beyond Aotearoa: Nationalism and War’, provides information on what Indo-New Zealanders did during the world wars, and the fine line they trod between standing up for King and Country like their New Zealander counterparts and their stand for the Indian independence movement. The actual involvement of Indians in New Zealand’s war efforts seems to be rather thin as presented in this book. World War I efforts are all centred on one person: Santa Singh. And World War II efforts were mainly in the supporting role of delivering essential supplies in the form of fresh vegetables to the allied army. The role of Indo-New Zealanders in Indian independence is presented in a lengthy quote (over 10 pages) from the personal reminiscences of Jerambhai Ravjibhai. It is important to trace the connection between the Indian diaspora and the politics of the homeland, but this chapter could be greatly strengthened with empirical research results from New Zealand and stronger theorisation.

The chapter richest in content and with the best analysis is Chapter 5, ‘Gender and Family’. It is fascinating to learn that Indian women, whose popular stereotypes include child brides, arranged marriages, and strict caste rules, have creatively used their migrant experience in New Zealand to positive effect, somehow liberating themselves from the close supervision of mothers-in-law and senior women in the clan. The trade-off for this new-found freedom is loneliness and a lack of extended family support. New Zealand offers the women a much more enlightened social climate while depriving them of close family interaction. The arguments and observations put forward in this chapter are well-considered and largely consistent, obviously the result of critical enquiry of the research data. There is an apparent contradiction, or at least an unconvincing argument, however, when the author writes about ‘the regimentation of reproduction’ (p.116) citing Plunket visits as ‘regimentation’. To this reviewer, this is an inconsistency, because elsewhere the author has observed that New Zealand life bestowed benefits on Indian women, and the extended
family’s attention could at once be supportive as well as coercive.

The thinnest chapter is the last, entitled ‘Legacy’. It tells the personal stories of three Indian individuals who lived very long lives, saying that their lives encompassed the changes of Indo-New Zealand society. It gives the stories of how David Lange befriended the community, and how Anand Satynand became Governor General. The chapter touches on the 1987 immigration change, noting how the new policy allowed an influx of educated middle class Indians which has changed the face of the Indo-New Zealand community drastically. One would have hoped for a stronger analysis of these watershed years, but this is absent.

All told, this volume is the fruit of a labour of love of a diligent social anthropologist who has worked tirelessly in the community for decades. The publisher has produced a very handsome volume which the families whose stories are told will love to keep. The dust-jacket encompasses the history of the Indian community in New Zealand: the front cover resplendent in red and gold showing a close-up photograph of the lighting diya at Diwali in 2002. The back cover is a bromide print of an Indian family on their Johnsonville farm. The former shows a young Indian woman in her ceremonial sari, her face full of reverence and concentration as she lights the lamp. The latter shows the family in plain workday attire, with little cultural ‘badges’ to mark their ethnicity. Between these two contrasting photographs is the hundred years of tribulations, struggles and triumphs of the Indian community in New Zealand. The images remind readers that what we see in the twenty-first century – the public and triumphant celebration of Diwali – has not been achieved easily without long struggles and hard work, as the family on the back cover graphically portrays.