CHRISTMAS IN CALCUTTA: ANGLO-INDIAN STORIES AND ESSAYS

by Robyn Andrews
New Delhi: Sage Publications India Pvt Ltd.
ISBN 978-81-321-1348-5 (HB)

Reviewed by
David Weaver, Victoria University of Wellington

Robyn Andrew's well researched book, *Christmas in Calcutta*, provides many little-known facts about the Anglo-Indian community in Calcutta. It is a timely look at a community of which most people outside India are quite ignorant. As such it makes a useful and original contribution to academic research.

Andrews has divided her book up into four Sections: Identity, Faith, Education and Community Care, together with an extensive Introduction and a brief Conclusion.

The Introduction contains a broad outline of how the author became involved in her subject, her family involvement, details of her research programme, her research methodology and how she became familiar with both the locale and the everyday life of the Anglo-Indian community. Andrews also challenges the often expressed view that the Anglo-Indian community is heading for extinction:

In this work, I will show, through the telling of particular people's lives and the discussion of a set of current issues, that the Anglo-Indians of Calcutta are still a vibrant, culturally distinct community in the 21st century. They are a community that has long had a place in India and they continue to be a significant and influential feature on the Calcutta city landscape (p. xxxiv).

The Introduction also includes the official definition of an Anglo-Indian (p. xxxi). This reference from the Indian Constitution reveals the little-known fact that it is possible to be Anglo-Indian through domicile rather than solely through mixed ethnicity. Also, if the European element is only on the female

side, this does not constitute grounds for being considered Anglo-Indian, thus clearly exposing the patrilineal nature of the community.

In the first section, 'Identity', Andrews tackles the formidable task of establishing the identity of the Anglo-Indian community. Their social standing in India is encapsulated in the words of Angelina, her first interviewee:

In my opinion we were always a second class citizen. Whether it was the European who used the Anglo-Indian …. And now it is the other way around [the Indians]…. So this is the difference between the past and the present (p. 9).

This interview with Angelina provides an excellent insight into the Anglo-Indian perceptions of their place in Indian society both before and after Independence.

Andrews also details distinctive characteristics of the Anglo-Indian community, which include speaking English as their mother tongue, the depth of their Christian faith and, more surprisingly, historically being mainly endogamous. She mentions them being spurned by Europeans prior to Independence and how this rejection has, in her view, led to the development of a separate community with its own character. She posits the idea that 'Indians and Anglo-Indians are accommodating each other's cultural practices'. But is this 'distinct community' sustainable? What is also apparent, from the evidence presented, is that the blending of Western aspirations, social behaviour and dress with Indian customs, such as Hindu-style festivals, gender bias and Indian cuisine, has created a hybrid community, one which is vulnerable to acculturation from both directions.

The second section of the book is dedicated to 'Faith'. This whole section is a fascinating fund of information, clearly showing Andrews meticulous research. For instance she states that about 80 percent of the community are Catholics (p. 67). Regrettably she does not go on to explain why this is so, given that most Anglo-Indians would have had British and therefore mainly non-Catholic forebears. What is really interesting about this section, however, is not the depth of Anglo-Indian devotion, which is entirely understandable given the levels of deprivation within the community, but more their community-specific religious practices and how these directly demonstrate the cross-cultural nature of their lives. The incorporation of Hindu symbolism into their religious tradition is both intriguing and unexpected. How has it come about and why? One is again left with the impression that the community, as described, is a hybrid one, not quite Western or quite Indian.

The third section, 'Education', opens with the bold claim that: 'Anglo-Indian schools and teachers have always been in the vanguard of Indian education…. Anglo-Indian schools still hold sway across the length and breadth of the subcontinent' (p. 99). Andrews highlights that their schools were created by and still are mainly 'affiliated to churches' (p. 124). These Anglo-Indian educational institutions provide a life raft to many impoverished Anglo-Indian children but at what social cost? Unfortunately Andrews does not examine this possibility. Secondly, she refers to the phenomenon of illiterate and uneducated English speakers within the community, describing this as a throw back to pre-Independence days when to be an English-speaking Anglo-Indian was a job guarantor in itself, but which has now become a negative unless accompanied by both a sound education and fluency in a vernacular language.

Andrews concludes her book with a section on 'Community Care'. She speaks positively about the many ways the community provides support to its people, ranging from educational support through social support to care for the elderly. She stresses the resultant benefits in terms of communal identity: 'The most effective way of achieving this [a sense of community] is through the various organisations' (p. 179). Andrews does not balance these benefits against the less desirable attributes of over-dependence on and general acceptance of institutionalism. Along the way, she relates sad stories of gradual descent into poverty, destitution and loneliness. Ultimately the prospect of a place in a rest home is seen as a blessed relief. As Meryl, an elderly interviewee, says: 'I never thought I would ever come to an old age home [but] I found I was very glad that I came' (p.204). On the one hand it is to the community's credit that old age homes are available for her but is it not also to the community's discredit that she was driven through deprivation to seek one out?

In her 'Final Words', Andrews states: 'My aim has been to affirm what is being done so well by Anglo-Indian social service organisations' (p. 207) and then goes on to say that these organisations are both 'at the helm of the community' and 'vital for Anglo-Indian sustenance' (p.207). I was left wondering, however, whether a healthy and dynamic community can really be based on social support institutions, no matter how effective they are?

In conclusion, I commend Andrew's book as an interesting and useful compendium of facts and stories about the current Anglo-Indian community in Calcutta. However, I would have welcomed more in-depth analysis of important points such as possible reasons for such a heavy reliance on institutions and the likely consequential affects on the long-term health of the community.

COLLABORATIVE ETHNOMUSICOLOGY: NEW APPROACHES TO MUSIC RESEARCH BETWEEN INDIGENOUS AND NON-INDIGENOUS AUSTRALIANS

Edited by
Katelyn Barney
Melbourne: Lyrebird Press.
ISBN 9780734037770 (PB)

Reviewed by
Henry Johnson, University of Otago

The title of this edited volume published in 2014 explains clearly the nature of the book – collaboration. In this case, the focus is on collaboration between indigenous and non-indigenous Australians, although many readers would be able to relate this aspect of music research methodology with other (post) colonial or field study locations. From the outset, the reader is led into an approach that has difference and cultural understanding at its core.

While collaboration has long been a focal point for ethnomusicological research, if not a grounding principle, the character of that collaboration has not always been foregrounded either by method or perspective. As the study of people making music, ethnographic research underpins the ethnomusicological data gathering process, and it is here that researchers must inherently collaborate in one way or another with culture bearers and informants of the music under study. Past practice, however, has often meant that it is through the researcher's voice alone that the music is presented in research findings, and while collaborators may be the subject of study, they have been given little mention in written word.

Collaborative Ethnomusicology advocates for more collaboration in ethnomusicology. Using case studies between indigenous and non-indigenous Australians, Barney has brought together a number of different approaches to contemporary music research that help show how such methodology is not only ethical in practice, but also inspirational in what it can reveal about music-making and research perspectives. Following a short Introduction by the editor, 10 chapters offer examples from the Australian context of postcolonial indigenous research that help highlight this distinctive approach to ethnomusicology in this location in the current era.

Many types of collaboration, past and present, are outlined in the Introduction by Barney. Pointing out that the time is now right for a full discussion of col-

laboration, this chapter notes the importance of positionality with such methodology, which is sometimes referred to as 'action research' or 'participatory community research' (p. 3). As shown in the chapters in this book, approaches to collaboration vary considerably and 'there is no one way to ensure successful collaboration between indigenous and non-indigenous music researchers' (p. 7).

Margaret Somerville's chapter is a theoretical one that seeks to reflect on the collaborative contact zone and uses the author's experience of working with Pintubi women as a conduit for discussion. Using Mary Louise Pratt's notion of the 'contact zone' as a way of foregrounding power relations, Somerville notes that such a site is actually one of a 'discomfort zone'. 'The contact zone was found to be a place of productive tension based on difference. It was simultaneously characterised by mobile and shifting boundaries involving complex border crossings in a space of transformation' (p. 17).

Karl Neuenfeldt explores his collaborative experiences in the recording and production of community-based CDs / DVDs. His focus is on copyright and ownership, and he discusses some of the legal issues involved along with relevant research protocols when working with indigenous Australians. One of the key factors involved in such collaboration is working with a cultural broker who not only mediates between researcher and community, but also provides invaluable knowledge about who to ask a specific question. This type of applied project has collaboration at its heart: producing recordings for and about community-based performers who might not ordinarily be able to create such a project, and offering collaboration at every stage of the work.

Payi Linda Ford, Linda Barwick and Allan Marett offer a chapter that outlines a collaborative research methodology to study the indigenous ceremonies of the Tyikim culture in the Northern Territory. As well as applying methods more typical of ethnomusicology, the research also utilised the indigenous framework referred to as *mirrwana-wurrkama*, which was developed by Ford. This is a metaphor to describe the processing of poisonous cycad palm nuts and making them edible during ceremonies. Their detailed ethnographic chapter outlines indigenous ceremonial practice through collaborative methodology where such practice emphasises 'longstanding relationships (things that people share) rather than social categories (things that separate people by highlighting differences)' (p. 43).

A critical approach to ethnomusicology as ethical and decolonising practice is offered in a collaborative framework by Elizabeth Mackinlay and Gordon

Chalmers. As their first co-authored publication, this partnership shows collaboration in an array of areas. They talk of 'being-in-relation' (p. 65) as key to their research agenda, particularly as a notion that can help to deconstruct how knowledge is often 'mis/re/presented' (p. 65) in research paradigms that are usually prevalent in ethnomusicological research. They note the way their research approach of 'being-in-relation' has produced an 'ethic of connection' (p. 79) that has the aim of contributing to change in colonial ways of thinking that so often underpin research about other people.

The notion of 'contact zone' is taken up in the chapter by Katelyn Barney and Monique Proud in their case study of collaborative music research in the aboriginal community of Cherbourg in Queensland. The authors, indigenous and non-indigenous, explore collaboration from many angles, and include much critical and reflexive practice to help show how such an approach 'can allow Indigenous and non-Indigenous researchers to engage in dialogue, have equal voices, and improve relationships between Indigenous and non-Indigenous peoples' (p. 83). The authors outline in detail the processes they went through to work within this contact zone. They offer their respective and joint voices in the description and analysis and conclude by reflecting on some of the benefits of the collaboration. In the end, they stress that the process was one of learning from each other, but there were moments of where 'discomfort zones' (p. 96) were evident.

Robin Ryan and Uncle Herb Patten offer a chapter that reflects on two decades of collaboration in a contact zone studying process and productivity in Koori music. In their chapter, the authors discuss a method of data collection they used, which they refer to as 'yarn-up'; that is, 'an Indigenous style of spoken dialogue that privileges oral history' (p. 98). The researchers note that they have seen their collaborative process turn from 'reconciliation music scholarship' to 'recognition music scholarship' (p. 114) in the sense that communication between cultures and researchers is better than none at all.

In their chapter on the National Recording Project for Indigenous Performance in Australia, Aaron Corn and Payi Linda Ford examine collaborative research processes with the aim of forging a distinct approach to ethnomusicology in Australia 'that embraces a plurality of diverse intellectual traditions and expressive modalities' (p. 115). In doing this, the authors aim to provide relevant outcomes for the communities in which they are undertaking such collaborative research practices in the first place.

The idea of performance-based collaboration as a conduit to research-based

collaboration underpins the chapter by Genevieve Campbell and Teresita Kilapayu Puruntatameri. The collaborators founded the performance group Ngarukuruwala-We Sing Songs, and used that creative context for reflection as part of research practice. Their partnership works at many levels of engagement, and the chapter brings many sides of their work to the surface, especially in the sense that it is the 'criss-crossing of roles and motivations' (p. 146) that has made their collaboration work.

Aaron Corn and Wantarri Jampijinpa Patrick collaborate in a chapter that looks at the teaching of the course, 'Indigenous Music and Media', at the Australian National University. As a five-day, second-year course that is taught in the School of Music, the collaborators come together to blend ethnomusicological scholarship with indigenous knowledge to offer 'an intensive, immersive experience designed to emulate some of the rich intensity and intercultural stimuli of [indigenous] festivals' (p. 150).

The last chapter of the book is by Sally Treloyn and Rona Googninda Charles. Their particular collaboration explores the idea of discomfort in intercultural ethnomusicological research collaboration in the Kimberley. Drawing on the notion of a 'contact zone' as a 'discomfort zone', their project explores difference and hybridity 'where acknowledgement of productive tensions enables transcultural production of knowledge' (p. 171).

Collaborative Ethnomusicology contributes much to contemporary ethnomusicological thought, not only as a reflection of much current practice in the Australian context on indigenous musical knowledge, but also more broadly by providing convincing and informative models for others working in ethnographic music research to follow.

FAT: CULTURE AND MATERIALITY

Edited by
Christopher E. Forth, & Alison Leitch,
Bloomsbury: London, 2014. 207 pp.
ISBN: 978-0-85785-616-6 (HB), 978-0-85785-509-1 (PB),
978-1-47252-018-0 (e-pub)

Reviewed by
Cat Pausé, Massey University

SLIPPERY, SIZZLE, SPLAT: MAKING MEANING OF FAT MATERIALITIES

The post-disciplinary field of fat studies is building its library one text at a time. From Braziel and LeBesco's *Bodies out of bounds* (2001), to the 2014 addition to Ashgate's Queer Intervention Series, *Queering fat embodiment* (Pausé, Wykes, & Murray), edited collections allow for scholars from a range of disciplines to explore fat under a larger theme or framework. The most recent offering from Bloomsbury considers the materiality of fat. As noted by one set of contributing authors,

As a substance, [fat] exists outside of the body (leftovers on a plate in the fridge], it exists within the body (settling itself around thighs and hips, hearts and lungs), and yet fat also exists on the surface of bodies, appearing as cellulite, saddlebags on the thighs, and wobbly wings on arms (Cain, Chamberlain, and Dupuis, p.123).

Fat, whether an oil, dietary substance, bodily substance, or performance, has a range of properties and many diverse meanings. Within the introduction, the lead editor urges the reader to consider how fat materialises in different forms, and how different individuals-times-cultures experience and respond to the various representations. Forth (2012) has argued before that fat is a 'slippery substance both materially and conceptually', and now has worked with his co-editor Alison Leitch, to prepare a collection that allows a group of scholars to try and capture the substance between their analytical fingers (p. 92). The chapters included could be considered as those that approach fat as substance outside of the body, and those that approach fat as a substance within/as part of the body.

Following the introduction, the collection continues with two essays that explore fat as a substance for consumption. Meneley's chapter on olive oil and Weiss' chapter on the flavour of pork fat invite the reader to consider the con-

nections of these substances to culture, religion, and health. Through a consideration of olive oil in Palestine, for example, the reader is encouraged to appreciate the importance of its materiality to Palestine's economy, spirituality, and national identity. The chapters then move away from fat as food, and into a multitude of variations of the substance. Essays probe historical meanings of fat through Biblical and classical texts, the use of fat as a material by the artist Joseph Beuys, and the role of clothing in the lived experiences of fat women and how they construct their spoiled identities.

Lavis' chapter on the meanings of fat for individuals with anorexia presents the strongest consideration of fat in multiple material representations: fat as a dietary substance, fat as a bodily substance, and fat as an identity. The analyses are woven across the three materialities in a coherent and successful way. It could have provided an excellent bridge between the half of the collection that focuses on fat as a substance outside of the body, and the other that focuses on fat as a substance within/as part of the body. Unfortunately, it does not.

The most intriguing chapter for me finds the author examining the 'medico-technological deployments of fat' through breast augmentation and reconstruction (p. 109). This chapter presents a new material relationship to examine: fat as substance within the body, which is harvested and possibly manipulated, to be then injected back into (another) body. This fat is first unwanted, but becomes a valued product outside of the body, and then desired and admired once placed back inside (another). Ehlers establishes that fat is valuable as unwanted tissue waste through its reuse in other areas. Fat transfer, fat grafting, fat banking, and fat auto genesis, are all ways that fat tissue is repurposed through biomedical technologies ('fat biotechnologies'). These processes take what is seen as excess and unnecessary and redeploy it for another purpose at a profit. And the demand for such products are growing, Ehler explains, as fat banks like Liquid Gold are established to trade in the commodity of body fat.

Fat as commodity is also considered in the final piece of the collection, as the reader is invited to learn about the use of fatsploitation by celebrities. Fatsploitation, according to the author, is an act in which the actor finds great value in 'perform[ing] the materiality of fat in the context of weight loss and gain' by capitalising on our disgust with fatness, 'in order to commodify themselves and sell diet products' (p. 142). The relationship between disgust and fat is a common theme throughout the collection, and Mobley does the best job of exposing the intersections involved. She peels back the many layers of our disgust and fascination with body shame and people selling, I mean losing, their dignity (excess pounds) for a commercial audience.

In the introduction, Forth argues that fat studies scholarship has often largely ignored the materiality of fatness, with a 'focus less on the body than on the positioning of fat subjects' (p. 5). He suggests that this collection does not qualify as fat studies scholarship, but I disagree. Throughout this text, fat is recognised as having no essential meanings or ontology; the contextual nature of fat considerations is woven throughout the collection, and this is one of the qualities that make it eligible for consideration as a fat studies text. Many of the contributing authors pull from formative theorists in fat studies literature as well, such as, Kathleen LeBesco, Robyn Longhurst and Samantha Murray. For me, this collection sits alongside *The Fat Studies Reader* (Rothblum & Solovay, 2009) and *Fat Studies in the UK* (Tomrley & Naylor, 2009), nicely. It is a valuable addition to the shelves or e-reader of anyone interested in fat studies scholarship.

REFERENCES

Braziel, J. E. and K. LeBesco, eds. 2001. *Bodies out of Bounds: Fatness and Transgression*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Forth, C. 2012. Melting Moments: The Greasy Sources of Modern Perceptions of Fat. *Cultural History* 1 (1): 83–10.

Pausé, C. J., S. Wykes, and S. Murray, eds. 2014. *Queering Fat Embodiment*. Surrey, England: Ashgate.

Rothblum, E. and S. Solovay, S. eds. 2009. *The Fat Studies Reader*. New York, NY: New York University Press.

Tomrley, C. and A.K. Naylor, eds. 2009. *Fat Studies in the UK*. York, England: Raw Nerve Books.

FOOD BETWEEN THE COUNTRY AND THE CITY: ETHNOGRAPHIES OF A CHANGING GLOBAL FOODSCAPE

Edited by
Nuno Domingos, José Manuel Sobral and Harry G. West
London: Bloomsbury: 2014. 251 pp.
ISBN 9780857855381

Reviewed by
Isa Ritchie, University of Waikato

This book presents a diverse range of research topics, themes and locations. Although the chapters seem disparate, central themes do run through many of them. One is the negative stereotyping of the rural as uncivilised in comparison to the civilised urban. The authors argue that this is a false dichotomy which is more accurately represented as a dynamic, shifting and interactive continuum incorporating migration and social change. Another theme through multiple chapters is the romanticising of the rural and of traditional food production and preparation. This romanticism can be used to hide class tensions. Notions of class and privilege are perhaps the most central and congruous thread that appears to run through each chapter, alongside food itself. The latter is positioned as central, not only to life and livelihoods, but also to politics and to understanding power dynamics, history and social struggle.

Building on the classic work of Raymond Williams (1973, 1977), this book can be read as a journey that begins with a thoughtful introduction by the editors, which considers historical and contemporary rural-urban prejudices and concerns, reflecting on them in various cultural contexts. These are said to give rise to the following questions:

> How will an increasing urban population be fed and what will people eat? Must the country feed the city, or might cities feed themselves? How will depopulating countrysides sustain themselves – by feeding cities or by other means – if at all? What will food cost in the future, and how will its costs be met? What will be the environmental implications of changing patterns of food production and consumption, and are these patterns sustainable? And what are the implications of urbanization, and the attendant transformations of the production and processing of foodstuffs, for the quality of food, including its safety for consumption, its nutritional value and its organoleptic properties? (p. 3).

These questions are explored through the variety of different cultural contexts and researcher perspectives that follow. In the first chapter, Nuno Domingos discusses conflicting rural wine narratives over class, identity, and history in Southern Portugal. The second chapter by Emma-Jayn Abbots, moves on to examine local perspectives on romanticised images of country women in Highland Ecuador. Perceptions of both traditional and modern processed food are then explored through Elizabeth Hull's fieldwork, carried out amid changing landscapes of rural South Africa, then Harry G West digests one family's experiences of heritage food tourism in the French Auvergene.

The second section of the book is more urban in focus and begins with Laura B. DeLind's self-aware personal reflections on tensions around class and privilege in her work with urban agriculture in the United States. I found this chapter particularly interesting because of its genuine tone, the clear location of the researcher in relation to privilege and because of its relevance to my doctoral research on local food and food sovereignty in New Zealand. Here, DeLind critiques the rosy success story often told about urban agriculture projects as well as the mechanistic approach to problem solving favoured by local councils, neither of which acknowledge or address underlying issues of hegemonic struggles in their attempts to productively reassign the use of land which is constructed as 'empty', a term which undermines local histories, and people's stories and experiences:

> Problems, by implication, need to be solved. Our hyper-positivism, fuelled by science and technology assures us that for every problem there is a solution… Problems (and solutions) when taken out of context – without redundancies, without memories, and without the strain and wisdom of local ownership – have brittle solutions. We only have to ask ourselves why housing projects fail and why soup kitchens thrive to know this is so (p. 95).

DeLind argues that in order for urban agriculture to be more inclusive of the disenfranchised people who often occupy its surrounding neighbourhoods more connections must be made and more public conversations must be conducted.

The journey continues through to Johan Pottier's chapter on the shifting urban-rural relationship negotiated by migrant poor in Lilongwe, who balance food production on rural land, which is often inherited matrilineally, with odd jobs and city life in order to stay food secure. Maria Abranches continues this theme of rural-urban complexity as well as colonisation, proximity, familiar-

ity and strangeness, though perceptions of city-grown crops in Guinea-Bissau on the West African coast. From here, we return to Portugal, this time for José Manuel Sobral's discussion of the construction of national food identity in relation to other contemporary countercultural movements focussed on reclaiming traditional food.

The otherwise largely contemporary ethnographic narrative then segues into Sami Zubaida's historical expose of seventeenth century Egyptian satire on peasant life. This somewhat incongruous jump does, however, continue the thematic threads of rural stereotypes and references more contemporary literature, locating it nearer to the present narratives than one might expect. The following chapter is all about yogurt discourses. Maria Yotova brings us back to the present, with Bulgarian and Japanese perceptions of the authenticity of the Bulgarian marketed 'grandmother's yogurt' and the local and international interplays thereof. Finally, Monica Truninger and Dulce Freire explore the scientific commendations and nuances of the Mediterranean diet, which is constructed as a traditional and unchanged pathway to health, despite being inaccessible to the underprivileged.

Although seemingly incongruous at times, this volume presents a smorgasbord for a variety of interests and tastes. Here, contradictions and counter-narratives are not shied away from, but are actively described and explored along with tensions arising from globalisation and corporate exploitation. Food is presented here as a symbol for understanding culture, society and politics, from the minutiae and often harsh realities of every-day life to how these struggles for coherency, understanding, wellbeing and food security are imbedded in wider socio-political and global contexts. This book ought to be recommended to researchers with a particular interest in food and the various cultural and political tensions around it.

REFERENCE

Williams, R. 1973. *The Country and the City*, New York: Oxford University Press

GREEN CONSUMPTION: THE GLOBAL RISE OF ECO-CHIC

Edited by
Bart Berendregt and Rivke Jaffe
Bloomsbury: London/New Delhi/New York/Sydney, 2014. 204 pp.
ISBN 987-0-85785-714-9

Reviewed by
Trisia Farrelly, Massey University

Green consumption is marketed as either traditional, frugal, simple, or a combination of these. Green and ethical products provide us with more than what is overtly marketed. Their purchase can also provide a psychological service by relieving the guilt we feel about contributing to global poverty and environmental devastation. A simple and ethical life is now fashionable and marketed as if all of the ills of the world can be solved by our shopping choices. This volume edited by Dutch anthropologists, Bart Berendregt and Rivke Jaffe aims to illustrate the multiple and often paradoxical ways in which green consumerism, or what has come to be known as 'eco-chic', is marketed and consumed in the global North and South.

The editors' contributions include a thematic framing in the first chapter of the book and each provides a case study: Jaffe's contributions are Jamaica's *ital chic* and Berendregt's Eastern tropical spa culture. While generally critical of eco-chic, the editors recognize that disregarding eco-chic as mere tokenism or cynicism misses its inherent cultural complexities. The proposition is that only when we understanding how the consumer marketplace works, can we then implement strategies that make social and environmental differences meaningful. While passive activism involved in choosing greener products is often considered gateway behaviour to more impactful activism, consumers still need to be smarter about greenwashing by determining the real intentions of government and corporates.

The nine contributions to this book are thematically categorised: From Production to Consumption; Spatialities and Temporalities; and Bodies and Beauty. These contributions include urban and rural case studies from developed and developing contexts. The eighteen contributors from across the globe are predominantly sociologists and anthropologists but there are also contributions from geographers and political scientists.

It is not clear in Richard Wilk's Forward or the editors' introductory chapter how the contributors became involved in the volume's development and all the

contributions provide an almost uncritical support for the key points raised by the editors in the introduction. Therefore, it could be argued that one of the weaknesses of the book is a lack of critical treatment of the editors' assertions.

The collection defines eco-chic as 'a combination of lifestyle politics, environmentalism, spirituality, beauty, and health, combined with a call to return to simple living' (p. 1). The editors draw our attention to the relative ideological shallowness of eco-chic: green consumption focuses our attention on 'the wrong kind of consumption' thus suppressing the call to reduce consumption as the key solution to addressing global environmental and social ills. Yet, the editors do not condemn eco-chic and the contradictory practices that emerge from this seemingly shallow approach to addressing global consumption challenges. Instead, they argue for the 'careful scrutiny' of eco-chic practices. It is clear from the contributions in this volume that if we simply dismiss eco-chic as an upper and middle class attempt to feel better about themselves/ourselves, we fail to identify the cultural complexities inherent in global consumption practices and, by extension, ignore the politics of consumerism highlighted in this volume.

A key theme running through the collection is that of class distinction since eco-chic is 'increasingly a part of the identity kit of the upper classes, offering a way to combine taste and style with care for personal wellness and the environment' (p. 1). The contributions in this collection show that the class distinction underlying eco-chic consumption originates in the industrial North, yet this distinction has also been 'promoted, appropriated, and transformed' in the developing South. Fascinating contradictions emerge when contemporary consumption values and practices of developed elites converge with those considered 'traditional' or 'peasant'.

The editors' introduction aims to address three major questions with which the contributors engage within its three key themes: Why is eco-chic so popular now? What is the role of local contexts in determining eco-chic's various manifestations? Despite its apparent inherent contradictions, how can it make meaningful headway toward global sustainable consumption? While the introduction addresses these questions, they could have been more clearly mapped and structured throughout this chapter.

In answer to the first question, the editors argue that the accelerated speed of communication and production has given rise to a number of countermovements advocating slower and more traditional modes of living. This slow living movement has contributed to the maintenance of class distinc-

tion. Understanding the breadth of diversity of eco-chic as they are taken up in wealthy and emerging economies is a key task of this book. For example, Barendregt shows how Westerners are offered the opportunity to experience the long-perceived authentic sensual and mysterious experience offered by the Eastern tropical spa while Southeast Asian middle and upper classes consider the spa to be an experience threatened by Westernization and thus worthy of revitalisation.

Each of the contributions in this book speaks to the second question, 'What is the role of local contexts in determining eco-chic's various manifestations?' The ethics, materiality and practices associated with eco-chic are manifest differently and often paradoxically depending on cultural context. Drawing on the topic of Ghanaian dreadlocks, Anna-Riikka Kaupinnen and Rachel Spronk show how eco-chic can have a very different cultural impact in different locales and temporalities and how it can intensify identities. Until recently, Ghanaian dreadlocks symbolised backwardness, and yet they are now valorised and representative of a reread or reclaimed modernity of health, beauty and spirituality.

In the first theme: 'From Production to Consumption', the editors propose that green consumption is related to anxieties about the social and economic implications of globalization. This proposition is related to new forms of participation in the politicisation of the market. It is argued that while there is potential for consumer activism, consumer citizenship places too much responsibility on the consumer and diverts attention from broader powerful social and economic structures and processes. As Sabine Luning and Marjo de Theije highlight in Chapter 4, this has meant a greater focus on corporate social responsibility (CSR).

Many paradoxes are also inherent in the politics of eco-chic consumption. For example, eco-chic products invoke producers and consumers to be socially and environmentally responsible by respectively growing and buying locally. However, this can obfuscate both inequalities in production and those who can afford to buy local products at 'boutique'/'farmer's market prices'. For example, Murray and Welch-Devine explain in Chapter 5 how *terroir* in the Basque region can be a double-edged sword: while it can be used in eco-chic branding to improve local sustainability and cultural and political advancement, it can also mask the differences between local producers and inequalities in production. *Terroir* can also misrepresent local identities and reinforce national misrepresentation. Bryant and Goodman in Chapter 3 draw on the example of Ecuador's Ariba Cacao to illustrate how eco-labelling can be misleading, as

fair trade has the potential to exclude the poorest producers. Robert Foster's (Chapter 2) 'politics of products' on the other hand, offers a positive future direction for eco-chic, involving consumer manipulation of brands. However, its potential is offered by the author with little optimism for its efficacy. In this section, Goodman and Barnes' present the 'celebrity-compassion-consumption complex' as social enclaving or gentrification of sustainability practices. Their chapter illustrates who can talk, teach and partake in the salvation of the planet and the poor.

'Spatialities and Temporalities' is the second key theme in the volume. The local is privileged in eco-chic production and consumption as it emphasises traditional, nostalgic, slow, green, and ethical products. However, as has been noted in Murray and Welch-Devine's *terroir* example, these discourses are often informed by exclusionary nationalist policies and xenophobia. Another paradox is presented in Chris Hudson's case of the greening of Singapore. Here, the city's high dependency on consumption is juxtaposed against its commitment to environmental sustainability. This paradox is presented alongside the strong theme of class distinction with Singapore's first president Lee Kuan Yew's dedication to transforming Singapore's city-state and former British colony into an elite first world geopolitical space.

The third key theme in the volume, 'Bodies and Beauty' explores what the desire for beautiful bodies means for the intersections of production and consumption, social justice, and sustainability. Here more paradoxes emerge. For example, second hand clothing used to be seen as dirty, unfashionable, and only for the poor lower classes. Yet now they are considered vintage and fashionable eco-chic. Rivke Jaffe's chapter on *ital chic* illustrates how Rastafari counter-culture and its products and services, once considered by many upper class Jamaicans as dirty and somewhat disreputable, is now 'trickling' up and has begun to emerge repackaged as 'an eco-friendly stance with a back-to-the-roots ideology, coloured by a strong black consciousness' (p. 133).

The case studies I found most compelling in this volume were the ones that illustrate how eco-chic products are marketed to the middle to upper class in a way that masks socioeconomic disparities while simultaneously reinforcing class, gender, and ethnic divisions. A case in point is Cairns, deLaat, Johnston, and Boumann's presentation of how eco-chic is driven by gendered models of caring consumption and affect. The guilt and fear of mothers is the focus of analysis in this chapter. The authors emphasises how female consumers are so often saddled with the responsibility of ensuring their families are purchasing products that are safe and environmentally ethical – the guilt felt more keenly

when these products are expensive (as they often are). Their contribution also highlights the paradox of a slowness sought in the production and consumption of eco-chic in urban spaces with fast-paced lifestyles.

In the concluding chapter, the editors draw attention back to themselves, their contributors, and to some of their readers to ask how we are complicit in constructing 'nature' and '*terroir*'. They also point out that we have a responsibility to interrogate what are often long and complex commodity chains in which fair trade products are embedded. This edited collection will be of interest to academics and non-academics interested in interdisciplinary cultural approaches to sustainable global consumption.

SENSES AND CITIZENSHIPS: EMBODYING POLITICAL LIFE

Edited by
Susanna Trnka, Christine Dureau, and Julie Park
Abingdon, Oxon: Routledge. 2012. 294 pp.
ISBN 9780415819336 (HB)

Reviewed by
Paul H. Mason,
Woolcock Institute of Medical Research, University of Sydney

Comprising eleven chapters, an engaging afterword, and a well synthesised, tour-de-force of an introduction, *Senses and Citizenships* is a deeply stimulating edited volume that tackles the anthropology of the nation-state with respect to growing bodies of theory on embodiment. This rich collection of essays contemplates protean relationships between the body and the state in the European Union territories, Fiji, India, Indonesia, Morocco, Nepal, New Zealand, colonial New Hebrides, the Solomon Islands, and the Federated States of Micronesia.

Christine Dureau's chapter, 'Visibly Black', engages lucidly with the invidious logic of autoracism in the Western province of Solomon Islands. Drawing upon history and self-reflexive ethnography, Dureau demonstrates how colonial narratives of inclusion inflected people's aspirations to be incorporated into part of a greater whole. Dureau offers a compelling exposé of the contradictory sensibilities to critique but seek inclusion.

Susanna Trnka begins a discussion about the relationship between virtuous

pain, social belonging and citizenship that continues in later chapters. Indo-Fijians assert their equal rights to social, legal and national recognition through political rhetorics articulating the pain and physical suffering of indentured labourers, a point of comparison with African American narratives of forced slave labour. Both forms of citizenship claims on the state, Trnka finds, counter yet concomitantly intersect with hegemonic constructions of citizens as active participants in capitalist production.

From within the confinement of a psychiatric clinic in North India, Sarah Pinto queries how choreographies of sensation are configured by participation in an exclusion from society arranged by state and non-state actors. Fruitfully drawing upon dance theory, Pinto spotlights the structured improvisation of Indian women living on the margins of traditional values of marriage and medicalised notions of normality.

Among the women of Fes with whom Rachel Newcomb conducted ethnographic research in Morocco, the preparation, smell and taste of national dishes tie into regional affiliations and national identity. As gender roles change and female identity shifts increasingly towards the role of citizen-consumer, new culinary sensibilities focussing on consumption have displaced the local market banter, the long hours of communal food preparation, and food sharing practices.

In the first of two chapters on Indonesia, relative, situational and fluid sensory experiences of ethnicity permeate Anika König's ethnographic research among Kanayatn Dayak villagers in West Kalimantan. During times of conflict, explanations of ethnic difference between the visually indistinguishable Dayaks and Madurese transmigrants were ascribed to corporeal, sensory dimensions, and categorisations of smell and body odour relating to food consumption and religious affiliations.

The gendered, nationalist significance of Lata Mangeshkar's adolescent female voice in Indian cinema is Gregory Booth's muse in 'Gender, Nationalism, and Sound'. From the 1950s onward, the perceived innocence of Lata's voice tapped into Mahatma Gandhi's valorisation of female strength as national character and simultaneously balanced participation in modernity with adherence to traditional respectability. The dominance of Lata's voice in the powerfully hegemonic postcolonial Hindi film industry has become an aural embodiment of India's past. Maternal ideology, Booth finds, has been replaced by a more masculine voice that embodies the globalised consumer-capitalist India of today.

Moving on from ethnomusicology and on to dance anthropology, Felicia Hughes-Freeland speaks strongly to the theme of sense (rasa) and citizenship (kewarganegaraan) in the second chapter on Indonesia, 'Embodied Perception and the Invention of the Citizenship'. Through her ethnography of Yogyakarta-style court dance, Hughes-Freeland details not only how the nation-state is imagined but also how it comes to be embodied at particular moments. Dance produces persons as much as it is produced by them. During President Suharto's New Order regime (1966–98), reified classical Indonesian dance produced imagined and embodied national belonging.

Uli Linke, in her heated chapter 'Off the Edge of Europe', focuses on visual technologies used in constituting and defending the borders of a white suprastate. Securing the realigned borders of a supranational, securocratic Europe has involved aggressively policing black subjects and performatively monitoring black outsiders.

For the probationary citizen-subjects of colonial New Hebrides, as Alexandra Widmer makes clear, assistant physicians were trained to see health like a state and were inculcated into the sensibilities of a nascent biomedical citizenship. Like Sarah Pinto before her, and Julie Park after, Widmer highlights the power of medicalisation in constituting citizenships and national identities.

'Painful Exclusion' is a lucid chapter by Julie Park clearly explicating how vulnerable citizens can be left with permanent disabilities as a result of their unequal citizenship. In the 1980s and 1990s, haemophilia patients, who were intimately reliant on the New Zealand state for their healthcare, were left exposed by government neglect to HIV and Hepatitis C infection. To publicly express their extreme exclusion from citizenship, and to work towards a partnership with the nation, haemophilia patients had to transcend embodied national values of stoicism, restraint and an arcadian disposition. The chapter offers a convincing articulation of the links between socio-political context and limping, damaged bodies.

Returning to the theme of suffering and sociality, Jason Throop writes of sensory nostalgia for hardship and the orientation of moral sensibilities towards physical exertion among the Yapese of the Federated States of Micronesia. As a critique of contemporary monetary exchanges that are disembodied and socially disconnected, the Yapese long for sensorial worlds and moods of a distant past where adversity, endurance, and physical effort are believed to have brought about stronger sentiments of belonging both to each other and to the land.

In a poetic afterword, Robert Desjarlais reflects upon moments during his own fieldwork and uses a literary style to evoke the senses in an ethnographic encounter with the other. The central themes of the book are distilled, summarised and used as the basis for a set of orienting questions for aspiring anthropologists.

Senses and Citizenships is published as part of the *Routledge Studies in Anthropology series*. The book would easily suit undergraduate and postgraduate curricula. The contributors, all anthropologists, have visibly worked closely together to produce a richly integrated volume that samples a breadth of topics relating to embodiment and nationalism. A couple of chapters left some room for further analysis about how nuanced experiences become embodied deeper than the skin. A couple of other chapters drew only weak links to the topic of citizenships. However, as a whole the book is a great package. Broadening the terrain beyond nationalism, the volume also hints at a postnational world where transnational communities are formed around shared embodied experiences, subnational groups assert distinct identities, and supranational incorporation destabilises conventional imaginaries. From pain, toil, and violence, to music and dance as well as more mundane expressions of national belonging, *Senses and Citizenships* is a robust example of contemporary anthropological scholarship.

WINE AND CULTURE: VINEYARD TO GLASS

Edited by

R.E. Black and R.C. Ulin

New York: Bloomsbury, 2013. 336 pp., 6 b/w illustrations, bibliog., index.
ISBN 9780857854018. US$42.95 (PB)

Reviewed by

Peter Howland, Massey University

This edited volume on the anthropology of wine is a welcome addition to wine scholarship, which has gathered pace of late across the social sciences and humanities (in particular, geography and history), and especially so over the past two decades.

The editors argue that anthropologists have until recently paid little attention to wine, and 'food more generally' (p. 4.). Although I am unconvinced by the latter claim, their argument that the lacuna of anthropological studies of wine

is linked to the discipline's primary focus on exoticised, bounded, apparently non-coeval, small-scale and indigenous 'Others' – along with the consequential devaluing of 'at home' ethnographic research – definitely has resonance. The editors' additional argument that the recent 'maturation of the anthropology of Europe' has created a constructive space for the anthropological study of wine, which is significantly produced and consumed in European, North American and other 'Global North' societies such as Australia, has similar merit.

Thirteen of the volume's articles focus on wine production, place construction, labour organisation, and winemaking technologies and associated values in the Global North, ranging from bench-marking 'super-premium' French wines through to post-soviet production in Slovakia, Bulgaria and Georgia, with sojourns to Western Poland, Australia and Spain. As such the volume provides an important foil to anthropology's persistent, and frequently erroneous, Occidentalising tendencies. The two remaining 'Global South' articles examine wine production in Chile and Lebanon, and overall the volume promotes a comparative ethos, as would be expected of anthropological enquiry, which manifests in the form of historical, geographic, practice and conceptual comparisons – the latter being especially evident in two articles on 'natural' wines by Paul Cohen and Rachel E. Black.

Written by a mixture of well-established and emerging anthropologists, the volume is divided into four sections – 'Rethinking Terroir'; 'Relationships of Power and the Construction of Place'; 'Labor, Commodification, and the Politics of Wine'; 'Technology and Nature'. The boundaries between sections are often fuzzy and blurred, again as should be expected of anthropological enquiry with an emphasis on intersectional research and analyses. Indeed the editors' stated intent is to promote how 'anthropology's unique emphasis on culture, social relations, representations, and power' (p.7.) can be deployed to generate critical understandings of the varied historical, political, sociocultural and globalised trajectories of wine. In this the volume also highlights anthropology's often able deployment of holistic enquiry, or what is more likely these days to be framed as assemblage approaches. Moreover, it provides many potential pathways into understanding the globalisation of wine. This is particularly evident in Marion Demossier's article – 'Following the Grand Crus: Global Markets, Transnational Histories, and Wine' – which explores the critical issue of how localised constructs of place, quality, aesthetic, etc. of Bordeaux's grand crus wines are deployed differently across the globe and how in return these different deployments potentially impact on localised values and practices.

The insistent assemblage, scale-shifting approach is one of book's strengths,

and furthermore many articles are centred on the critical analyses of wine production, which is more commonly the reserve of hard scientists and earnest economists. In exploring wine production, contributors have also critically examined dialogic links between various constructs and evolutions of affirming (sometimes contested) authenticities of place, people, privilege, history and associated familial, generational, local, regional and national identity praxis. This is exemplified in Juraj Buzalka's article – 'Tasting Wine in Slovakia: Postsocialist Elite Consumption of Cultural Particularities' – which discusses how post-socialist wine production is increasingly based on French notions of quality, terroir-specific, social distinction-conferring, wine consumption. Its production is significantly facilitated by an 'economic paradox' of lower tax exemptions for wine compared to other alcohols, privileging (and arising from lobbying by) an emergent generation of neoliberal individualists. The new political-social regime, which also deploys romanticised notions of heritage preservation, is significantly distanced from previous socialist-cooperative models producing uniform wines bereft of any regional or class-oriented marketing and based on German notions of quality determined by sugar content. Adam Walker and Paul Manning's article – 'Georgian Wine: The Transformations of Socialist Quantity in Postsocialist Quality' – critically plots a similar trajectory, albeit against a historical scale that begins with winemaking in the region 8000 years ago. It traverses the socialist rejection of bourgeois consumption and identity enactments which insisted that 'luxury' goods be made available to all (resulting quality being sacrificed for quantity); which contemporarily exists alongside the enduring cultural phenomenon of 'supra', a form of hierarchical, competitive and quantitatively-focused wine toasting ritual that reproduces masculine identities and status, which continues to exist beyond state control.

Similar assemblage dynamics are evident in Section I – 'Rethinking Terroir' – although here the authors tend to traverse more well-trodden and straightforward analyses, which could have been enhanced by exploring how terroir is linked to broader imaginaries and practices of class, individuality, science, cosmopolitanism, and so on. Robert Ulin's argument that assertions of terroir offer 'a partial but nonetheless important corrective to the ubiquity' (p. 67) of wine's commodity fetishism is an interesting perspective, and one that he mercifully pulls back from when re-situating terroir amidst the power and privilege that is reproduced by naturalising agricultural products, production and proprietorship.

The volume also demonstrates how anthropologists are increasingly attempting to amalgamate the ethnographic study of the 'totality of life in the social round' (p. 5) with the study of different scale-making processes that generate

the regional, national and transnational. The focus, however, tends to be mid-range and above and as such critically examines the structural and institutional (i.e. industry, regional, national) conceptualisation, organisation, regulation and strategic uses of terroir, place/people constructs, authenticity and history, etc. Moments of 'deep ethnography' are few, as is to be expected of any word-limit constrained, edited volume. Nevertheless, such moments tend to be highly revealing as when Elizabeth Saleh – 'Pursuits of Quality in the Vineyards: French Oenologists at Work in Lebanon' – follows an imported, French-trained, status-bestowing 'wine engineer' (i.e., oenologist) around vineyards in the Kefraya region of West Bekaa, Lebanon, to assess the 'readiness' of ripening grapes. In the process she reveals how 'technopreneurs' not only represent the increasing globalisation of specialised labour, but also the global spread of the 'naturalised' aesthetics of production, taste and associated socioeconomics. Without a specific discussion of deep ethnography, yet clearly based on such, is an excellent contribution from Winne Lem – 'Regimes of Regulation, Gender, and Divisions of Labor in Languedoc Viticulture' – on tensions and convergences in the family-based, gender-divided production of lesser quality Languedoc wines through regimes of consent-orientated 'familial hegemony' and the more coercive 'familial authoritarianism'.

This book is not without weakness, however. As with any edited volume, the quality of argument and analyses is variable. There are a couple of instances in which greater editorial guidance is clearly warranted – one in which the arguments canvassed lack both originality and seeming awareness of prior, influential research in the specific field canvassed; and another in which the author has confused phenomena at different scales to make an invalid overarching argument. Additionally, there is marked absence of articles focused on wine exchange, distribution and consumption, tourism, sociality, marketing and promotions, let alone other sites of wine in Asian, North America, South Africa and other South American places – although I understand the decision to restrict the volume was the publisher's and was based on volume size and associated economics. This can easily be rectified by follow-up volumes, which are hopefully on the editors' 'to do list'. Nevertheless this volume is a very timely, well-grounded clarion call to anthropologists and other social, cultural and humanities researchers to increase their research, publication, collaboration and recruitment efforts in the scholarship of wine – Mauri ora!